

Comparison of April 2016 Montreal Protocol Amendment Proposals

KEY ELEMENTS	NORTH AMERICAN PROPOSAL	INDIA PROPOSAL	EUROPEAN UNION PROPOSAL	ISLAND STATES PROPOSAL	AFRICAN GROUP NON-PAPER
Listing of HFCs	- 19 HFCs in one annex - Two groups	- 19 HFCs in two annexes - Five groups	- 19 HFCs in one annex - Two groups	- 22 HFCs (including three HFOs) in one annex - Two groups	- 21 HFCs (including two HFOs) in one annex - Two groups

Non-Article 5 Measures (Developed Countries)

Non-Article 5 Measures	Control Period & Length	2019—2036 17 years	2016—2035 19 years	2019—2034 15 years	2017—2033 16 years	Control period to be determined
	Control Measures for HFC	2019 – 90% 2024 – 65%	2016 – 100% 2018 – 90%	2019 – 85% 2023 – 60%	2017 – 85% 2021 – 65%	Schedule to be determined based on TEAP study on technology availability, cost, safety, energy efficiency, and environmental considerations
Production and Consumption (per cent of baseline)	2030 – 30% 2036 – 15%	2023 – 65% 2029 – 30% 2035 – 15%	2028 – 30% 2034 – 15%	2025 – 45% 2029 – 25% 2033 – 10%		
Baseline (GWP-weighted)	<i>Consumption:</i> Average of HFC + 75% of HCFC consumption in 2011-13 <i>Production:</i> Average of HFC + 75% of HCFC production in 2011-13	<i>Consumption:</i> Average of HFC consumption in 2013-2015 + 25% of HCFC baseline <i>Production:</i> Average of HFC production in 2013-2015 + 25% of HCFC baseline	<i>Consumption:</i> Average of HFC + 45% of HCFC consumption in 2009-2012 <i>Production:</i> Average of HFC + 45% of HCFC production in 2009-2012	<i>Consumption:</i> Average of HFC consumption in 2011-2013 + 10% of HCFC baseline <i>Production:</i> Average of HFC production in 2011-2013 + 10% of HCFC baseline	Baseline to be determined	

Article 5 Measures (Developing Countries)

Article 5 Measures	Grace Period (beyond beginning of Non-Article 5 control period)	2 years	15 years	None	3 years	Grace period to be determined
	Control Period & Length	2021—2046 25 years	2031—2050 19 years	2019—2040 21 years	2020—2040 20 years	Control period to be determined
	Control Measures for HFC	2021 – 100% 2026 – 80%	2031 – 100% 2050 – 15%	<i>Consumption:</i> 2019 – 100% HCFC & HFC combined limit	2020 – 85% 2025 – 65% 2030 – 45%	Schedule to be determined
Production and Consumption (percent of baseline)	2032 – 40% 2046 – 15%	National phase down steps are to be decided 5 years in advance for the next 5-year period	<i>Production:</i> 2019 – 100% 2040 – 15% Further and intermediate steps agreed by 2020	2035 – 25% 2040 – 10%		

Baseline (GWP-weighted)	<i>Consumption:</i> Average of HFC + 50% HCFC consumption in 2011-13	<i>Consumption:</i> Average of HFC consumption in 2028-2030 + 32.5% of HCFC baseline	<i>Consumption:</i> Average of HFC + HCFC consumption in 2015-2016	<i>Consumption:</i> Average of HFC consumption in 2015-2017 + 65% of HCFC baseline	Baseline to be determined
	<i>Production:</i> Average of HFC + 50% HCFC production in 2011-13	<i>Production:</i> Average of HFC production in 2028-2030 + 32.5% of HCFC baseline	<i>Production:</i> Average of HFC + 70% of HCFC production in 2009-2012	<i>Production:</i> Average of HFC production in 2015-2017 + 65% of HCFC baseline	
Multilateral Fund Financing	Agreed incremental costs. Support to implement an amendment.	Full conversion costs; costs of second conversion where transitional technologies are deployed. Starting at beginning of control period.	Agreed incremental costs	Agreed full incremental costs starting in advance of control period	Sufficient, unconditional support
Sponsor's Estimate of Climate Benefit	Consumption of 90-112 billion metric tonnes CO2 eq. avoided through 2050.	Unspecified	Net benefit of 79 billion metric tonnes CO2 eq. by 2050, not inc. HFC-23 by-product reduction benefits.	Unspecified	Unspecified
Impact on UNFCCC/KP	Complementary, with continued HFC emissions reporting	Complementary, with continued HFC emissions reporting, suggests UNFCCC amendment	Complementary, with continued HFC emissions reporting	Complementary, with continued HFC emissions reporting	Complementary
Import/Export Licensing	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Unspecified
Relationship to HCFC Phase Down	Does not alter HCFC schedule	Does not alter HCFC schedule	Does not alter HCFC schedule	Does not alter HCFC schedule	Unspecified
Further Review and Exceptional Provisions	Technology reviews to evaluate availability of alternatives	Continued use of transitional HFCs & HFC blends where low-GWP options do not yet exist.	No	No	Exceptional measures for countries with high ambient temperatures
Feedstock Provisions	Unspecified	No controls on feedstock applications.	Unspecified	Unspecified	Unspecified

Exemptions	Unspecified	Exemption of HFCs for MDIs & other medical applications. Provision for essential use nominations (EUN).	Unspecified	Unspecified	Unspecified
Allocation of Imported HFCs	Unspecified	Unspecified	Importing party responsible for consumption	Unspecified	Unspecified
Controls HFC-23 By-product Emissions	Yes	Prohibits control under the Montreal Protocol. Proposes comprehensive R&D to find feedstock & process agent uses to minimize emissions	HFC-23 emissions not to exceed 0.1 percent,	Production of HFC-23 not to exceed 0.1 per cent of HCFC-22 or Annex F substances in that production line.	Unspecified
Bans HFCs Trade with Non-Parties to Amendment	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Unspecified